

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

**Minutes of
The Lehman College Senate Meeting
Wednesday, November 17, 2010
Senate Meeting**

23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31

Senators Present: Akan, A.; Alborn, T.; Almodovar-Salines, D.; Amaoma, C.; Badru, L.; Bamshad, M.; Bard, A.; Bayne, G.; Bennett, M.; Bergmann, R., Blot, R.; Bullaro, G.; Calvet, L.; Carrellas, P.; Carey, R.; Carney, J.; Choudhary, A.; Clark, V.; Correa, D.; DellaPina, M.; DeSimone, F.; Dobson, C.; Duhaney, C.; Eldridge, D.; Eleyinafe, O.; Farrell, R.; Feinerman, R.; Fernández, R.; Gálvez, A.; Garçon, M.; Greenberg, J.; Gross, C.; Haghghat, E.; Hattori, T.; Iddrisu, A.; Jacobson, B.; Jarroll, E.; Jervis, J.; Jitianu, A.; Kolb, P.; Lawrence, A.; Levitt, J.; Lizardi, H.; Lucente, J.; Magdaleno, J.; Marianetti, M.; Markens, S.; Matthews, E.; Maybee, J.; Mineka, J.; Nadeem, S.; Nyemba, T.; O'Connor, N.; O'Hanlon, T.; Olabode, A.; Onyedum, J.; Papazian, M.; Peruyero, C.; Philipp, M.; Prohaska, V.; Qian, G.; Raaum, R.; Rachlin, J.; Rice, A.; Rotolo, R.; Sokol, M.; Soto, M.; Souare, I.; Tananbaum, D.; Thomas, G.; Tilley, J.; Troy, R.; Voge, S.; Waldo, I.; Warde, B.; Whittaker, R.; Wilder, I.; Zapata, Stephanie.; Zermatt-Scutt, M.; Zucchetto, V.

32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43

Senators Absent: Artinian, A.; Banoum, B.; Barnard, J.; Beard, C.; Borrell, L.; Brooks, O.; Buckley, M.; Cheng, T.; Deveaux, F.; Di Paolo, M.; Esteves, C.; Fermin, A.; Fletcher, D.; Freedberg, S.; Gilbert, F.; Gorokhovich, Y.; Henry, P.; Holloway, J.; Howze, P.; Jafari, M.; Jones, L.; Kabat, D.; Kayaalp, O.; Larimer, A.; Martin, O.; Munch, J.; Ndukwe, K.; Omare, D.; Ricourt, M.; Ross, S.; Samuels, Y.; Schlesinger, K.; Schwartz, G.; Sesay, F.; Sibermintz, N.; Silverman, H.; Sloan, H.; Thompson, P.; Totti, X.; Twomey, R.; Wunder, A.;

The meeting was called to order by President Ricardo R. Fernández at 3:43 p.m.

President Fernández made a motion to adopt the minutes of the Senate meeting of October 13, 2010. The motion was seconded, and the minutes were approved as corrected. On line 114 the word should read unwieldy, not unyielding.

Announcements and Communications—

- a. 1. President Fernández announced that not much has changed on the issue of the budget since the October meeting. In anticipation of what's coming in the future, he's appointed a committee made up of representatives of the Senate Budget and Long Range Planning Committee, College Faculty Personnel and Budget Committee and members of the

44 administration, to look at potential places where economies and efficiencies can be found,
45 to ensure that the money is being spent in the most effective manner possible. He looks
46 forward to the recommendations based on analysis of the entire institution.

47 2. Yesterday, Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Executive Officer Allan Dobrin and
48 Senior Vice Chancellor for Budget, Finance and Fiscal Policy Marc Shaw visited Lehman.
49 Mr. Shaw has extensive experience in state and city government. He reported that the
50 governor's budget will be probably not be ready before February 1, 2011 and that there
51 will probably be a significant reduction. CUNY lost \$205 million in two years. Steps are
52 being discussed with the Board of Trustees. None of this will be clear until the beginning
53 of the second semester. We will then have a better sense of the challenges at that point.

54
55 **b. Student Conference—**
56

57 Mr. Marvin Bennett reported that there is an issue with the proposed changes to the
58 Constitution for Student Government. There is some concern about the name. Next week
59 there will be a meeting that will address the need for clarity, and a better sounding name.
60 It was agreed that the resolution concerning the proposed changes to the Constitution for
61 Student Government under Old Business, would be deferred and would be addressed after
62 next week's meeting.

63
64 **REPORTS OF STANDING COMMITTEES—**
65

66 **c. Graduate Studies—**
67

- 68 1. Prof. Janet DeSimone presented an informational item from the Department of
69 Languages and Literatures and the Department of Middle and High School Education.
70 She also presented proposals from the Department of Speech-Language-Hearing
71 Sciences. The proposals were approved unanimously.
- 72 2. The last meeting for the semester is next Monday at 11:00 a.m.

73
74 **d. Governance Committee—**
75

- 76 1. Prof. Duane Tananbaum presented the resolution on the CUNY Compact. He pointed
77 out that the resolution was passed by the University Faculty Senate last evening and

78 had been discussed by the Governance Committee. The resolution was moved,
79 seconded and approved with one vote in opposition and no abstentions.

80 2. Prof. Tananbaum presented a slate of student nominees to the Senate Standing
81 Committees: for the **Governance Committee**: Ms. Tanaka Nyemba and Mr. Andrew
82 Lawrence. **Library, Technology, and Telecommunications Committee**: Ms.
83 Dannilda Correa, Mr. Oluwatosin Elemafe, Mr. Abisola Olabode and Mr. Charles
84 Beard. **Campus Life and Facilities Committee**: Ms. Tanaka Nyemba, Ms. Michaelle
85 Garçon, Mr. Ibrahim Souare, Ms. Gloria Thomas, Ms. Claudia Amoama, and Ms.
86 Abisola Olabode. **Graduate Studies Committee**: Ms. Dannilda Correa and Ms.
87 Anyelina Fermin. **Budget and Long-Range Planning Committee**: Mr. Iddrisu
88 Abubakari Sadiq, Ms. Fatima Sesay, Mr. Ivan Waldo and Mr. Charles Beard.
89 **Academic Freedom Committee**: Mr. Cornel Duhaney, Ms. Fatima Sesay, and Mr.
90 Oluwatosin Eleymafe. The slate of nominees was approved unanimously.

91 3. Professor Tananbaum also presented a resolution regarding the possible restructuring
92 of the college’s academic divisions, especially the possible realigning of departments,
93 which involves matters of considerable interest to the faculty and students. The
94 resolution asks that an *ad hoc* Senate Committee be created. This “Committee on
95 Structure” will work with College administration, to advise and make
96 recommendations to the Senate on matters pertaining to any restructuring initiative.
97 The Committee on Structure will consist of one faculty member from each Senate
98 standing committee, five students chosen by the Student Conference, the chair of
99 Executive Committee of the Faculty, and one administrator appointed by the President.
100 An *ad hoc* committee was determined to be the best way to address issues both broad
101 and narrow regarding restructuring at Lehman. Prof Tananbaum noted that the
102 resolution was developed with the cooperation of the administration.

103 4. Provost Mary Papazian commented on the above referenced resolution. She reported
104 that she would be glad to meet with student groups or faculty, and that this is a
105 dialogue intended to be broad and deep. Some of the changes require nothing more
106 than a name change, but others would require more thinking. These all have to be
107 looked at from all angles.

- 108 5. This committee would, according to the provost, help to identify what needs to be
109 changed. There are two areas involving only a name change, The School of Education
110 and The School of Continuing and Professional Studies. Other changes are more
111 substantive, and require a different kind of approval process. Dr. Papazian referred to
112 the planning for a School of Health Sciences, Human Services and Nursing. There is
113 also preliminary discussion about establishing a School of Arts and Sciences. Finally,
114 having a School of Business may make sense several years down the line.
- 115 6. There was a motion to call the question. It was unanimously approved. A vote on the
116 resolution was moved, seconded and approved. The Governance Committee is asking
117 the Standing Committees to conduct an election of all members to the *ad hoc*
118 committee by December 1st.
- 119 7. The next meeting of the Governance Committee is December 1st at 2 p.m. in Carman-
120 201.

121
122 e. **Committee on Admissions, Evaluations and Academic Standards—**
123

124 Prof. Anne Rice reported that at its meeting on Wednesday, November 10th, the Committee
125 approved the list of candidates for January 2011 graduation. She also reported as an
126 informational item that the committee is continuing a pilot test version of student evaluation of
127 teaching. The candidates for January 2011 graduation were approved unanimously, subject to
128 final verification by the registrar.

129
130 f. **Undergraduate Curriculum—**
131

132 1. Professor Barbara Jacobson presented proposals from two departments. From the
133 Department of Environmental Geographic and Geological Sciences: a new course and an
134 experimental course. From the Department of Physics and Astronomy: several changes in
135 the curriculum. The proposals were unanimously approved.

136 2. The next meeting is Wednesday, December 1st at 12:30 p.m. in Carman 263.

137
138
139
140

141 **g. Academic Freedom—**

142
143 Professor Mario González-Corzo, the new chairperson, reported that the Committee is
144 working on several projects. One being a strategy to reach out to the Lehman community
145 in general, and increase awareness of academic freedom.

146
147 **h. Library, Technology and Telecommunications—**

148 No report. The meeting will be rescheduled within the next two weeks.

149
150 **i. Campus Life and Facilities—**

151
152 1. Prof. Janette Tilley announced that there is no report. She also stated that she will be
153 replaced as chair by Prof. Wesley Pitts.

154 2. The next meeting is on January 22 at 2 p.m. in Music 313.

155

156 **j. Budget and Long Range Planning—**

157
158 1. Professor John Mineka reported that the faculty on the committee met with Vice-
159 President Vincent Clark and Provost Mary Papazian. The student representative was
160 absent.

161 2. The college has met the cuts to its budget thus far this year primarily by cutting its
162 OTPS budget, rather than personnel, staff or faculty. There have been some cuts of
163 adjunct faculty and college assistants. The College has resources to meet some further
164 cuts in the spring.

165 3. The provost told the Committee that any major budget cuts could be absorbed by not
166 hiring to fill vacant positions. This does not preclude the loss of adjunct faculty.

167 4. Professor Mineka stated that the chancellor seems to be preparing for the spring
168 semester by giving himself and his entourage of vice chancellors generous raises,
169 perhaps anticipating the money will be more difficult to come by in the future.

170 5. The chancellor has been emphatic that there will be no retrenchment, that is, no firing
171 of tenured faculty. Professor Mineka asked whether we should believe him, and added
172 that no one is saying anything about the loss of adjuncts and college assistants.

- 173 6. Governor-elect Andrew Cuomo is coming forth as a democrat with the intentions of a
174 republican. He is emphatic about cutting taxes, and cutting services, especially health
175 care and education. Professor Mineka asked: should we believe him?
176 7. Generally, there is certain complacency around CUNY about what will ensue in
177 January when students and faculty are on vacation.
178 8. Prof. Mineka stated that the college community should be sending letters and email to
179 the governor and to our representatives in Albany, and writing letters to the
180 newspapers. He suggested that the college community take to the streets.
181 9. He added that we should mobilize the support of our communities, of our students, the
182 parents and grandparents of our students, the brothers and sisters of our students,
183 everyone, in a word, who has a stake in CUNY.
184 10. CUNY faces major cuts. This is not merely a belt-tightening exercise. For the
185 chancellor, this is an opportunity to make major changes in the university and its
186 student body: eliminating programs, raising tuition and raising admission standards.
187 Attacks have already begun on the Center for Worker Education.
188 11. The faculty, the staff and the students will need to bet together and fight back hard.
189

190 **k. University Faculty Senate—**

- 191 1. Professor Manfred Philipp reported that last night, in an overwhelmingly positive vote,
192 the University Faculty Senate (UFS) Plenary acted to support the CUNY Compact. This
193 follows the support of the Compact by the UFS Executive Committee and the UFS Budget
194 Advisory Committee. The Compact provides for limits on the size of tuition increases,
195 instead favoring gradual tuition increases, with retention of tuition revenue inside the
196 university. It also emphasizes complete State and City coverage of mandatory costs. Such
197 a “maintenance of effort” provision had been advocated by the SUNY UFS in connection
198 with the proposed SUNY-CUNY Empowerment Act. There already is a “maintenance of
199 effort” provision for New York City’s support of the CUNY community colleges. The
200 Compact also emphasizes safeguarding full student financial aid. The vote followed
201 presentations on the university budget by Executive Vice Chancellor Allan Dobrin, Senior
202 Vice Chancellor Marc Shaw, and Associate Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza. New
203

204 York State Senator Toby Ann Stavisky, Chair of the Senate Higher Education Committee,
205 also spoke to the UFS Plenary about the state budget.

206 2. The Board of Trustees is expected to vote on a revised tuition schedule for Master of
207 Social Work programs, increasing tuition by \$500 for full-time students and \$50 a credit
208 for part-time students. In addition, the Board is expected to vote on an immediate 5%
209 tuition increase beginning in spring 2011 for all majors and categories. A further 2%
210 increase is expected in the fall. The overall budget request totals \$2.7 billion.

211 3. The failure to acquire tuition revenues promised by the proposed Empowerment Act
212 combined with the absence of sufficient state aid has resulted in the halt in student
213 admissions to Classics, French, Italian, Russian, and Theatre programs at the SUNY
214 University of Albany. While this kind of closure of undergraduate programs has not
215 happened yet in CUNY, there are hiring freezes, even for replacement faculty and staff, at
216 John Jay and Baruch Colleges, and the Graduate School.

217 4. At the Board of Trustees Public Hearing on Monday, leading officers of the PSC
218 testified against the proposed tuition increases. In testimony given in written form (since I
219 taught a class at the time of the hearing) I testified in favor of the increases, pointing out
220 that CUNY gets less money per student than SUNY, and spends about half the money per
221 full time student than do the NYC public schools. This, in my view, is academically
222 unsustainable and will not likely change, necessitating higher tuition. Despite the so called
223 CUNY Decade of the Sciences, the new units of CUNY are already establishing curricula
224 that fail to include high-cost basic science lab courses. In support of the UFS, I argued that
225 CUNY must have more money to hire more full time faculty, offer high quality courses
226 and have high quality general education curricula. Testimony at last night's UFS plenary
227 indicates that some students are leaving Borough of Manhattan Community College
228 because of the institutional poverty that they encounter there.

229 5. The chancellor has announced that the budget crisis, in its current dimension, with
230 nine-digit budget reductions, will likely lead to staff layoffs, but will not lead to
231 retrenchment of full time faculty. It will not be possible to use tuition alone to compensate
232 for the projected decreases in state support, since the decreases are so large that the tuition
233 necessary to counteract this would move tuition above the maximum level provided for by
234 the Tuition Assistance Program (TAP).

235 6. On November 22 the Board of Trustees is expected to vote to rescind the requirement
236 that CUNY degree candidates pass the CUNY Proficiency Exam (CPE). This rescission
237 will apply to all currently enrolled students, formerly-enrolled students, and students who
238 enroll in CUNY after the date of the resolution. At present, CUNY students must pass the
239 CUNY Proficiency Exam in order to obtain an associate or baccalaureate degree from
240 CUNY. Last month's report of the CPE Task Force recommended this action. The Board
241 of Trustees is also expected to facilitate the granting of tenure to tenured associate
242 professors who are being hired by CUNY. This is currently facilitated for tenured full
243 professors.

244 7. Associate University Provost Julia Wrigley has released a report on Transfer Student
245 Articulation. The report notes the difficulty that community college Associate in Applied
246 Sciences (A.A.S.) degree recipients have after transfer. It also emphasizes the changes
247 needed in curricula in order to make the transfer and articulation process more productive
248 for students. The most detailed critique of the document has been provided to the UFS by
249 Prof. Kevin Sailor of Lehman's Psychology Department.

250 8. In an October 28 memorandum sent to CUNY college presidents, Executive Vice
251 Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra Logue announced that, beginning in fall
252 2012, the effective date for promotion will coincide with the date of August
253 reappointment. In 2012 this will take place on August 24. As per New York State law, the
254 date of tenure will continue to be September 1. Promotion and tenure will still require two
255 separate votes in faculty P&B committees.

256 9. The UFS Executive Committee has met with all but one of the founding faculty of the
257 New Community College (NCC). Those faculty members emphasized the changes they
258 will make to the proposed content of NCC courses. It remains unclear if the core
259 curriculum courses will be changed so as to make transfer to the senior colleges any easier
260 than it now appears to be.

261 10. The UFS Executive Committee has met with Vice Chancellor for Human Resources
262 Management, Gloriana (Ginger) Waters, Senior University Director for Human Resources
263 Operations and Deputy to the Vice Chancellor Raymond O'Brien, and University Dean
264 for Recruitment and Diversity Jennifer Rubain on affirmative action issues. It is clear that

265 some members of the Board of Trustees wish to strengthen university compliance with
266 affirmative action guidelines.

267 11. At a recent UFS Plenary, Senior Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs and General
268 Counsel Frederick P. Schaffer emphasized that social security numbers are not to be
269 stored on items that can be lost, such as thumb drives and notebook computers. Some
270 colleges in the university persist in using social security numbers for student and faculty
271 identification.

272 12. UFS Chair Sandi Cooper, SUNY UFS President Ken O'Brien, former UFS officer
273 Lenore Beaky, and I gave talks at the AAUP Shared Governance Conference last weekend
274 in Washington DC. The SUNY and CUNY delegations consulted on the Empowerment
275 Act and the CUNY Compact.

276 13. Calendar items: The UFS Conference on the Provision of Public Higher education in
277 the Prisons will take place on February 4. UFS Chair Sandi Cooper discusses General
278 Education requirements with EVC Logue tomorrow morning. The CUNY Construction
279 Fund also meets tomorrow morning. The Council of Faculty Governance Leaders meets
280 this Friday, November 19 with Chancellor Matthew Goldstein and with Dr. Tina Good,
281 President of the SUNY Faculty Council for the Community Colleges. The UFS Executive
282 Committee holds a special meeting with Vice Chancellor Schaffer on November 30,
283 which is also the date of the all-day CUNY Government Relations Conference. The UFS
284 Budget Advisory Committee meets on December 3 with Vice Chancellors Marc Shaw and
285 Matthew Sapienza. On December 7 The UFS Executive Committee meets with Vice
286 Chancellor for the Community Colleges Eduardo Martí. [VC Martí represented CUNY at
287 the White House Conference on Community Colleges.] The Faculty Advisory Council to
288 the Research Foundation meets with President Richard Rothbard on December 10. The
289 CUNY and SUNY UFS Executive Committees have a joint meeting on December 17. The
290 UFS Executive Committee meets with Chancellor Goldstein on January 11.

291
292 Old Business—
293 The Resolution to amend the bylaws and the Governance Documents was postponed.
294

295 New Business—
296 There was none.
297

298

ADJOURNMENT

299

President Fernández adjourned the meeting at 4:42 p.m.

300

301

Respectfully submitted,

302

303

Esdras Tulier